

# Shreveport Historic Preservation Commission

## MINUTES October 28, 2020

Government Plaza  
505 Travis Street  
Shreveport, Louisiana  
Room 440, Metropolitan Planning Commission Conference Room

### Commissioners

Commissioner Gary Dr. Joiner, Chair  
Commissioner Billy Wayne, Vice Chair  
Commissioner Lane Callaway, Secretary  
Commissioner Dr. Cheryl White  
Associate Commissioner Jazmin Jernigan  
Associate Commissioner Dr. Amy Wren

### Visitors

Reggie Lewis, Raley & Associates  
(COA 20-16-HPC)  
Jonathan & Elizabeth Moreau  
(COA 20-17-HPC)  
Jose O. Vigil (COA 20-18-HPC)  
Clay Simon (COA 20-19-HPC)

### Shreveport-Caddo Metropolitan Planning Commission

Mr. James Djamba, Planner, Community Development Department  
Ms. Maryam Moradian, Community Development Department (via telephone conference)

1. Meeting called to order by Chair at 4:00pm with a quorum present.
2. Opening Remarks: Chair read the memorandum titled, *Identifying Procedures for Review of Applications* to all present.
3. Approval of HPC Minutes for September 15, 2020: The Chair asked for questions or discussion on the Minutes for September. Having none, the Chair asked for a motion to approve. Motion to approve was made by Commissioner Wayne and seconded by Commissioner White; unanimously passed.
4. New Business: There were five requests for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) considered with HPC recommendation made to Executive Director, Shreveport-Caddo Metropolitan Planning Commission (MPC). As well a Certified Local Government request.

4a. Certificate of Appropriateness – COA 20-16-HPC: 2106 Fairfield Avenue, Fairfield Historic District, Contributing Element, circa 1900, two story frame Colonial Revival.

MPC Staff Case Report: Ms. Maryam Moradian (via telephone conference) presented the application consisting of an aerial photo of the historic property, map, four drawings of the fire escape staircase, specification sheet for the fire escape staircase, three pictures of the historic structure where the staircase is to be installed, and three supporting documents. It was noted the exterior fire escape staircase is not compatible with the historic aspects of the building and neighborhood however is required by Life Safety Code NFPA 101, National Fire Protection Association. Also noted the exterior door replacing the original window set, will be exterior grade and wood. MPC recommended Approval with no stated conditions.

Public Comments: Mr. Lewis provided the background in transitioning the residential building into a commercial establishment. However the effort had been stymied in obtaining a

fire safety permit due to a fire code requirement for an exterior fire escape ladder from the second story of the building. It was originally thought the interior dual staircases would suffice, but the fire inspector noted the exit for these twin staircases on the ground floor were too close. Mr. Lewis stated the proposed pre-fabricated steel stairs are up to fire code and can be painted black or white to match the color of the building's exterior. As well, the exit door replacing the twin windows at the exit point from the second floor will reflect in style and design the building's historic doors. Mr. Lewis noted that once the fire safety inspection certificate is issued, then the building can become the law offices as intended by the original.

HPC Discussion and Vote on Recommendation: The Chair requested comments and questions from the Commissioners. Commissioner Callaway reminded all of a previous COA on this historic property. Back in April 2019 in COA 19-303-HPC; the HPC did approve alternation for installing an ADA ramp since the residential building was being transitioned to commercial use. Commissioner Callaway suggested keeping the color of the pre-fabricated fire escape stairs black and reinforced its location would not be seen from the Fairfield Avenue primary street view. Commissioner Joiner clarified the upstairs where the twin windows are to be replace, that the replacement exterior wood door would reflect as much as possible the historic doors original to the building.

The Chair thanked all for a good discussion and asked for a motion. Commissioner White recommended approval with the condition the fire escape be black in color. This motion was seconded by Associate Commissioner Wren and passed unanimously.

4b. Certificate of Appropriateness – COA 20-17-HPC: 409 Egan Street, Highland Historic District, Contributing Element, circa 1910-20, two story foursquare residential.

MPC Staff Case Report: Mr. James Djamba presented the application consisting of a map, aerial photo of the historic property, proposed elevation diagram, and 19 photos of the project some graphically modified to showcase the proposed repair and alternation work. This specific residential dwelling is scheduled to be demolished and currently in poor physical condition. However, the proposed alteration work would not only rehabilitate the building but turned it into a duplex allowing better use of this historic property in a low rental area. MPC recommended Approval with no stated conditions.

Public Comments: Ms. Elizabeth Moreau stated their aim is to provide safe quality housing and within that block own several residential rent houses. The owners have experience in transitioning older houses into duplexes for multiple tenants. The alteration will result in separate and self-contained apartments on each floor.

HPC Discussion and Vote on Recommendation: Commissioner Joiner congratulated the requesters for being sensitive to people and preservation of historic buildings as well as being entrepreneurs. Commissioner Callaway asked how the parking is arrange on the property when the duplex is completed. Per Ms. Moreau; one tenant uses the current driveway with the other using new driveway accessed from the alley in back of the building.

The Chair noting no further discussion, asked for a motion. Commissioner White recommended approval; seconded by Commissioner Wayne. The motion passed unanimously.

4c. Certificate of Appropriateness – COA 20-18-HPC: 421 College Street, Highland Historic District, Contributing Element.

MPC Staff Case Report: Mr. James Djamba presented the application consisting of a map, aerial photo of the historic property, six photos, diagram of the property, proposed floor plan, front and back elevation diagram, left and right elevation diagram, and proposed garage

elevation. The property is severely damaged and hollowed out with only the walls still standing but heavily deteriorated. The applicant is to demolish the standing remnants of the structure. However, the new residential dwelling is to mirror the floor plan, elevation, scale, and setback of the original house. MPC recommended Deferral with two stated conditions – additional details on the new garage and condition that the applicant make recommended exterior changes to match character of the Highland Historic District.

Public Comments: Mr. Vigil was present but had nothing to add.

HPC Discussion and Vote on Recommendation: The Chair requested comments and questions from the Commissioners. Commissioner Callaway stated the applicant had attended the HPC session on October 20 which did not have a quorum but with COA 20-18-HPC listed on the agenda. Afterwards, Mr. Vigil requested Mr. Djamba along with Commissioner Callaway and Associate Commissioner Jernigan to provide insights on the proposed project.

Having no additional discussion or questions, the Chair asked for a motion. Commissioner Callaway recommended approval reinforcing the two conditions by MPC especially that the applicant make recommended exterior changes to match character of the Highland Historic District. This motion was seconded by Associate Commissioner Jernigan. The motion passed unanimously.

4d. Certificate of Appropriateness – COA 20-19-HPC: 953 Trabue Street, South Highlands Historic District, Contributing Element.

MPC Staff Case Report: Mr. James Djamba presented the application consisting of a map, aerial photo of the historic property, three architectural drawings of the new carport including 360 degree exterior elevations, and three photos. Approval would cover demolition of the current garage with replacement by the proposed carport whose footprint is smaller than the garage. The new carport is reoriented to open towards the residential dwelling and away from Fairfield Avenue. This reorientation provides a significant factor in the safe use of the carport versus the current garage. MPC recommended Approval without any conditions.

Public Comments: Mr. Simon noted his concerns for safety backing out into Fairfield Avenue. New carport would make the space more useful, face towards the residential dwelling, with entry and exit points from the existing expanded driveway.

HPC Discussion and Vote on Recommendation: The Chair requested comments and questions from the Commissioners. General comments from Commissioners was the new carport made sense and noted the safety factor of the original garage.

The Chair noting no questions or further comments, asked for a motion. Commissioner Wayne recommended approval; seconded by Associate Commissioner Wren. The motion passed unanimously.

4e. Certificate of Appropriateness – COA 20-20-HPC: 924 Erie Street, South Highlands Historic District, Contributing Element.

MPC Staff Case Report: Ms. Maryam Moradian (via telephone conference) presented the application containing consisting of a zoning map, aerial photo of the property, site plan, three architectural drawings of the addition, four photo, and three administrative forms. It was noted the addition would be located on the west side of the existing two-storied residential dwelling with majority towards the rear of the existing house. The addition included a master suite and a covered patio with new exterior walls and new windows matching the existing house in style and materials. MPC recommended Approval without any conditions.

Public Comments: None.

HPC Discussion and Vote on Recommendation: The Chair requested comments and questions from the Commissioners. Commissioner Callaway recalled seeing the subject house from the street view in February 2019 when viewing the residential house directly across the street. He noted that due to the trees masking the front of the subject house, this beautiful historic residential house was a hidden gem. Additionally, since most of the proposed new addition is to the side and back of the house with only a narrow portion of the new addition facing the street, the trees again would mask the front elevation of the house. Commissioner Callaway, noted the applicant was the architect and the HPC had previously approved requested COAs for other historic buildings the architect had worked on.

There were no other questions or comments by the other Commissioners. The Chair, asked for a motion. Commissioner White recommended approval; with second by Commissioner Wayne. The motion passed unanimously.

#### 4f. Certified Local Government Review:

Topic: Comments for the State National Register Review Committee on Proposal to Retain Listed Status During and After Relocation, re: Caddo Parish Confederate Monument.

Scope: This review was requested by the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) from HPC as part of the duties of Shreveport being designated as a Certified Local Government (CLG). The scope of CLG duties include consideration and comment on actions pertaining to historic properties being nominated or already listed on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) within the City of Shreveport.

Simply per the NRHP provisions, if a historic property listed on the NRHP is to be relocated, this relocation causes the property to be delisted. Exception to this automatic delisting, is if the NRHP Keeper (i.e. Director) approves an exception prior to the property being moved. Using the NRHP definitions for types of historical properties that can be listed on the NRHP, the Monument is classified as a “historic object.”

The HPC’s approved recommendation and rationale is to be signed by the HPC Chair and by the Chief Elected Official (the Mayor) and forwarded to SHPO as part of the overall consideration by the State Review Committee. The Committee’s meeting is scheduled for December 3, 2020 to consider the topic noted above with HPC’s report due by December 1.

HPC Discussion: The formatted report form provided by SHPO for this CLG action contains three options, including: recommendation to list the subject property on the NRHP, recommendation not to list the subject property on the NRHP, or for the Commission not to make a recommendation. Reasons are to be provided by the Commission for its selected recommendation.

The Chair requested comments and questions from the Commissioners. All five Commissioners participated in the consideration in some depth on all three options – specifically to retain on the NRHP, not to retained, or not to make a recommendation. Additionally, the relationship of the listed property to the Seven Aspects of Integrity standards used for listing a historic property on the NRHP was discussed.

A consensus developed around the option of recommending not to retain this historic object on the NRHP. The rationale agreed upon was twofold: First; the original listing on the NRHP in 2014 was based upon the original setting and location in consideration of the Seven Aspects of Integrity at the original physical site in Shreveport. Secondly; if a new nomination is made to list this history object again on the NRHP, then it should be implemented as a fresh start

and considered as a new entry based upon the Seven Aspects of Integrity of its relocated site that is physically located outside the City of Shreveport.

Public Comments: None. Although the HPC agenda listed this topic and posted the agenda per the public meeting laws, no members of the public attended.

Call for Recommendation and Vote: The Chair noting no further comments or questions, asked for a motion. Commissioner White made the motion of recommending not to retain per the rationale noted above. This motion was seconded by Commissioner Wayne. The motion passed unanimously.

5. Updates, Historic Preservation Advising, and Business Items

5a. Collaboration with Property Standards' Environmental Court: Tabled.

5b. Legal Advisor for HPC: Tabled, to be discussed with City Attorney.

5c. Section 106 Consulting Parties – I-49 Inner City Connection: Commissioner Joiner participated on the Zoom conference hosted by the Louisiana Highway Department. This Zoom conference conducted on Tuesday, October 27 was the inaugural meeting of interested parties in the Section 106 analysis. One of the proposed routes for this federal interstates highway impacts on the St. Paul's Bottoms Historic Districts. More updates to follow as additional meetings are conducted.

5d. HPC Annual Report for FY2020 (October 1, 2019 thru September 30, 2020): Tabled, for consideration and approval at the November meeting.

5e. HPC Chair review of Determination of No Material Effect; re: 922 Kirby Place, Fairfield Historic District (October 14, 2020): Noted for information and becomes the inaugural Determination of No Material Effect case showcasing the recent collaboration at reviewing such cases between HPC and MPC.

6. Public Comments: The Chair asked for any public comments; there were none.

7. Adjournment: Having no addition business to conduct, the Chair requested a motion to adjourn. Commissioner White made the motion to adjourn; seconded by Commissioner Wayne; with resulting unanimous vote. Chair adjourned the Meeting at 5:35pm.