

# Shreveport Historic Preservation Commission

## MINUTES

Tuesday, August 20, 2024

4:00pm

Council Chambers at Government Plaza  
505 Travis Street  
Shreveport, Louisiana

### Commissioners

Commissioner Lane Callaway, Secretary  
Commissioner Jazmin Jernigan  
Associate Commissioner Verni Howard

### Visitors

Jerome Cox (COA 24-24-HPC)  
Curtis R. Joseph, Jr. (COA 24-24-HPC)  
Dreda and Matt Smith (COA 24-26-HPC)  
Jim Snyder (COA 24-27-HPC)  
Ryan Smith (COA 24-28-HPC)

### Shreveport-Caddo Metropolitan Planning Commission (MPC)

Mr. Adam Bailey, Community Planner / Design Manager, MPC and HPC Ex-Officio  
Mr. Walter Johnson, Community Planner, MPC  
Ms. Peiyao Li, Community Planner, MPC

### City Attorney's Office

Mr. Tanner R. Yeldell, Assistant City Attorney

1. Meeting was called to order by the Acting Chair at 4:40pm, with a quorum present.
2. Opening Remarks: The Acting Chair read the memorandum titled, *Identifying Procedures for Review of Applications* to all present and thanked the visitors for their patience in the delay of calling the meeting to order. *Administrative Note:* Delay in calling the meeting to order was due to not having a quorum at the original scheduled time. Many of the applications were nearing expiration and a delay would necessitate restarting the application process.
3. Approval of HPC Meeting Minutes: The Acting Chair asked for questions, comments, and discussion on the HPC Minutes for July 16, 2024. Having none, the Acting Chair asked for a motion, second, and vote. Commissioner Jernigan made the motion to approve, with second made by Associate Commissioner Howard. The motion passed with three affirmative votes, none against.
4. New Business:
  - a. Certificate of Appropriateness – COA 24-24-HPC: 1526 Creswell Avenue, Highland Historic District. Multiple renovations of a two-storied residential dwelling.  
MPC Staff Case Report: Ms. Li presented the COA consisting of two photographs reflecting the current frontal façade of this dwelling vice the same angle from 2021, zoning map, aerial photograph pinpointing the subject property, and photograph of a nearby two-storied dwelling within the Highland Historic District to showcase the proposed design of replacement windows. The proposed renovations are to replace seven existing windows current within the

front elevation and wood siding and repair the front porch's flat roof and front steps. Recommendation of the MPC Staff is Approval with two Conditions. First is the window trim feature shall be added back to the new windows and door to match the previous trim style and secondly, the new flat roof on the front of the porch shall match the style and design of the existing flat roof.

Public Comments: The Acting Chair thanked Ms. Li and asked for public comments. The property owner was present, and available to answer questions but had no remarks to make.

HPC Discussion and Vote on Recommendation: The Acting Chair thanked all and asked the Commission members for any comments or questions. Having no specific comments or questions, the Acting Chair requested a motion, a second, and vote. Commissioner Jernigan made the motion to Approve with a second made by Associate Commissioner Howard. Resulting vote was three affirmative votes for, none against.

b. Certificate of Appropriateness – COA 24-26-HPC: 906 Wilkinson Street, Fairfield Historic District. Two-storied brick Mediterranean Revival (or Italian Renaissance Revival) residential dwelling with a hip roof with terra cotta clay tile roofing material. Roof replacement includes changing the existing terra cotta roof tiles with standing red or green seam metal.

MPC Staff Case Report: Ms. Li presented the COA consisting of a photograph of the frontal façade of this two storied residential dwelling, zoning map, aerial photograph pinpointing the subject property, three photographs detailing the current tile roofing, an example graph detailing the architectural design elements of an Italian Renaissance building, three photographs of existing historic buildings with terra cotta tile roofing, four pages from the Building Code Report for 906 Wilkinson Street detailing the subject property (dated July 2, 2024), and a Metal Roof Estimate (dated July 24, 2024).

Mr. Bailey added that roof forms and materials are defining features of a historic building. The replacement of terra cotta tiles with standing seam metal roof material would impact the historic significance of this historic house as well as the historic integrity of the historic district where located. Mr. Bailey showed on the larger screen monitor the image of a standing seam metal roof material from a commercial webpage.

From the COA narrative, a previous case in 2022 proposed the replacement of existing roof tiles with modern asphalt shingles on an Italian Renaissance Revival dwelling within the Highland Historic District. This previous COA was denied by the MPC Executive Director.

Recommendation of the MPC Staff is Denial. Rationale from COA 24-26-COA:

1. All efforts should be made to ensure that the authenticity of the home's original & historic style is retained. Roof materials to be replaced shall not diverge from the historic and authentic style of an Italian Renaissance Revival home.

2. Synthetic, non-clay roof tiles matching the historic Italian Renaissance Revival style requirement can be sourced from a variety of manufacturers (at reduced cost) and can be used in lieu of imported clay tiles.

Public Comments: The Acting Chair thanked Ms. Li and Mr. Bailey and asked for public comments. The Acting Chair recognized Ms. Dreda Smith, the property owner. Ms. Smith noted that the MPC initially indicated approval of the alternate metal roofing material. Subsequently the owner received an additional notification with a denial. Ms. Smith noted the expense of replacing the terra cotta tiles as well as sourcing the materials and experienced roofers to do the job in Shreveport. She added that in her opinion, the metal substitute would not change the roof form and would be cheaper.

The Acting Chair recognized Mr. Bailey who noted upon closer examination the style of the proposed standing seam metal roof material was not in compliance with design standards of Article 4 of the Shreveport UDC.

The Acting Chair asked Mr. Matt Smith, the home owner, if he wanted to add any comment, and he reinforced the cost of terra cotta tiles.

HPC Discussion and Vote on Recommendation: The Acting Chair thanked all and asked the Commission members for any comments or questions. Associate Commissioner Howard asked Mr. Bailey if there were any other alternate roofing options that would be in compliance with historical integrity but less expensive. Mr. Bailey replied there were different materials and some options with possible lower costs. He began to look online to provide some visual alternatives.

Commissioner Jernigan noted there should be some metal or non-clay alternatives. Mr. Bailey stated a possibility but stressed the harmonious character needed.

Mr. and Ms. Smith, the home owners, added that they believed there could be alternatives that could meet the historic look and requirements.

Mr. Bailey found online roofing metal material that looked like terra cotta tiles in a display that resembled the shape and look of the current roofing on the historic dwelling. Commissioner Jernigan noted the visual seemed to be a good possible alternative and Associate Howard noted it seems to provide the historical integrity sought after. The Smiths expressed interest.

The Acting Chair asked for other questions or discussion. Having none, the Acting Chair requested a motion and recognized Commissioner Jernigan. Commissioner Jernigan made the motion to Approve a substitute metal version roof material that reflects the design, shape, look and expected color of terra cotta tiles – with a Condition the applicant would present an example of the metal to the Commission and MPC. Having a motion with a Condition, the Acting Chair asked for a second and vote. The second was given by Associate Commissioner Howard and the resulting vote was three affirmative, none against.

c. Certificate of Appropriateness – COA 24-27-HPC: 2610 Fairfield Avenue, Fairfield Historic District. New construction of multiple items.

MPC Staff Case Report: Mr. Johnson presented the COA consisting of a photograph of the frontal façade of this two storied residential dwelling, zoning map, aerial photograph pinpointing the subject property, detailed and colored rendering of the proposed swimming pool, and detailed and colorful rendering of the entire extent of the multiple items proposed. Items proposed for construction – extension of the back porch, new in-ground pool (with new stepping stones and new raised landscaping bed on either side of the pool), mini-putt course, and pickleball court – are all located behind the current house hidden from the primary street view. (It is planned as a future project, to convert an existing greenhouse structure in the back yard into a pool house.) Recommendation of the MPC Staff is Approval.

Public Comments: The Acting Chair thanked Mr. Johnson and asked for public comments. The contractor was present, and available to answer questions but had no remarks to make.

HPC Discussion and Vote on Recommendation: The Acting Chair thanked all and asked the Commission members for any comments or questions. Having no specific comments or questions, the Acting Chair requested a motion, a second, and vote. Associate Commissioner Howard made the motion to Approve with a second made by Commissioner Jernigan. Resulting vote was three affirmative votes for, none against.

d. Certificate of Appropriateness – COA 24-28-HPC: 911 Delaware Street, South Highlands Historic District. Alteration.

MPC Staff Case Report: Mr. Johnson presented the COA consisting of a photograph of the frontal façade of this two storied residential dwelling, zoning map, aerial photograph pinpointing the subject property, a photograph from the street-view annotated with the proposed new addition, a photograph from the rear of the existing house annotated with the proposed new addition, and four architectural drawings of the proposed addition. The proposed one-storied addition includes a new bedroom plus bath and an art studio. This new addition will connect to the existing home on the east wall of the existing residential structure and shall reflect and remain consistent with the color, materials, and siding and trim of the existing house. The proposed addition is set back from the front façade and will not compete with the original home’s design. The one-story roofline will be lower and will match the roofline of earlier rear additions to the home. Recommendation of the MPC Staff is Approval.

Public Comments: The Acting Chair thanked Mr. Johnson and asked for public comments. The contractor was present, and available to answer questions but had no remarks to make.

HPC Discussion and Vote on Recommendation: The Acting Chair thanked all and stated the original dwelling is not centered on the lot and therefore there seems to be ample space on the side and rear of the house to accommodate the proposed setback addition. The Acting Chair asked the Commission members for any comments or questions. Having none, the Acting Chair requested a motion, a second, and vote. Associate Commissioner Howard made the motion to Approve with a second made by Commissioner Jernigan. Resulting vote was three affirmative votes for, none against.

e. Certificate of Appropriateness – COA 24-30-HPC: 1824 Highland Avenue, Highland Historic District. Remodel / alternation residential dwelling into multiple family apartments. The Acting Chair made a motion to delay this application until the September 17 session of HPC and asked for a second and vote. Associate Commissioner Howard made the second with the resulting vote of three affirmative votes, none against. *Administrative Note:* Due to the delay in the calling the HPC session to order, the applicant had the flexibility to delay the hearing since the COA was not approaching its expiration time limit.

5. Updates, Advising, Awareness, and HPC Business Items:

a. Awareness: Summary of attending Forum 2024 hosted by the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions to be given by Mr. Bailey at the September session of HPC. One noteworthy idea from the Forum was creating a network of neighborhood-level associations in promoting historic preservation.

b. Update: Cross Lake Pumping and Filtration Plant – built 1931, approved to be listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

c. Update: Barret Elementary School – built 1916, approved by State Preservation Committee and forwarded to National Park Service for decision to list on National Register of Historic Places.

d. Update: Letter for evaluation accepted by the National Landmark Program that has begun preliminary evaluation to determine National Historic Landmark designation for The Strand Theatre.

6. Public Comments: The Acting Chair asked for any public comments and there were none.

7. Adjournment: The Acting Chair requested a motion to adjourn and asked for a second and vote. Commissioner Jernigan made the motion to adjourn that was seconded by Associate Commissioner Howard with the motion passing with three affirmative votes for, none against. The Acting Chair adjourned the HPC Meeting at 5:44pm.